Findings from NSSE and AAC&U: Some Educational Activities are Unusually Effective

Growing evidence that “high-impact practices” provide substantial educational benefits to students

[NSSE Institute for Effective Educational Practice]

Jillian Kinzie, Associate Director

High Impact Educational Practices

NSSE Users Workshop 2011

NSSE Additional Questions about High-Impact Activities

Activities collected include:
- Learning Communities
- Service Learning
- Research with a Faculty Member
- Study Abroad
- Culminating Senior Experience
- Writing Intensive (2008)
- Senior Seminars/Capstone Courses (2009)

NSSE Finding: Value of High-Impact Practices

Students who took part in one or more “high-impact practice” such as a learning community, research with faculty, study abroad, and culminating senior experience reported greater levels of deep learning and greater gains in learning and personal development.

From NSSE: Outcomes Associated with High Impact Practices

- Deep learning: Attend to underlying meaning of information as well as content; Integrate and synthesize ideas, information; Discern patterns in evidence or phenomena; Apply knowledge in different situations; View issues from multiple perspectives [NSSE’s Higher Order, Reflective, Integrative Learning items]
- Educational Gains: [items in NSSE #11]
  - General Education – Writing; speaking clearly; gen ed; critical thinking
  - Practical Competence – Working with others, solving real problems, work related knowledge
  - Personal/Social Development – understanding self; contributing to community;

Value of High Impact Practices

NSSE's Higher Order, Reflective, Integrative Learning Items
High-Impact Practices
Educational experiences that make a significant difference to student persistence, learning outcomes, and student success.

1. Pedagogical practices
2. Structural features

NSSE Items: FY High-Impact Pedagogical Practices
- Asked questions in class or contributed to class discussions
- Made a class presentation
- Prepared two or more drafts of a paper or assignment
- Worked with other students on projects during class
- Worked with classmates outside of class on assignments
- Tutored or taught other students (paid or voluntary)
- Participated in a community-based project as part of course
- Talked about career plans with a faculty member or advisor
- Discussed ideas from readings/classes with faculty outside class
- Received prompt feedback on your academic performance
- Worked harder than you thought
- Discussed ideas from readings/classes with others
- Had serious conversations with students of a different race or ethnicity and those who differ from you—religious beliefs, political opinions, or personal values

High Impact Pedagogical Practices
1. Engagement in effective educational activities in the first year is essential to student persistence & success
2. “Compensatory Effect” – historically underserved students benefit more than others from the same educational practices

EX: NSSE Univ. Results - High Impact Practices Pedagogical Practices

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>First Year Students ACL related Items (often+ very often)</th>
<th>NSSE Univ.</th>
<th>Comp Univ.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Asked questions in class or contributed to class discussions [1a]</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Made a class presentation [1b]</td>
<td>35%↑</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Worked with other students on projects during class [1g]</td>
<td>38%↓</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Worked with classmates outside of class on assignments [1h]</td>
<td>35%↓</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

NSSEville Results: FY High Impact Practices Pedagogical Practices* & Persistence

*significant difference
Who’d be Interested in HIP Pedagogical Practices at Your Campus?

- Faculty teaching first year courses
- Academic Advisors
- Orientation staff
- Academic support staff
- Programs for Under-represented students

How Might you Generate Interest?

- Create report of just these items
- Reference research that supports attention to these practices
- Disaggregate by race, gender, FG status

HIPs Resources

- National Survey of Student Engagement (NSSE) – Annual Results reports 2007-2010
- Student Success in College (2005, 2010) – documents what 20 high-performing institutions do to promote student success

HIPs Benefits & Outcomes

High Impact practices are positively associated with:

- Persistence and GPA
- Deep approaches to learning
- Higher rates of student-faculty interaction
- Increases in critical thinking, writing skills,
- Greater appreciation for diversity
- Higher student engagement overall


Senior Results & High Impact Practices

Service-learning: 18% (NSSEville) 17% (Urban)
Undergrad Research: 13% (NSSEville) 17% (Urban)
Internship: 50% (NSSEville) 42% (Urban)

What do these data suggest for NSSEville?
High Impact Practices (structural activities)

- **NSSE items:** 1k, 7a,c,d,f,h, also, 1e,u,v, 10c, 11l
- To explore on your campus:
  - What are participation levels?
  - Relationship between HIP participation and selected outcomes (grades, graduation, deep learning)
  - Document value-added aspect of education

Identify a HIP. Look across at an institutional type or a student characteristic. What do you notice?

Do All Students Experience High-Impact Practices?

- **Nope.** High Impact Practices Only Reach A Fraction of Students

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Overall NSSE Participation Levels:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>First Year Students:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning Communities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Seniors:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research With Faculty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study Abroad</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>FY Expectations??</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FY Plan to Do:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>First-generation, racial-ethnic, major differences too</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

NSSE results, see “Annual Results”

Involvement in HIPs Varies Substantially by Major

- Considerable differences in 4 largest-enrollment majors: English, biology, business administration, & psychology.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Research with faculty</th>
<th>Study abroad</th>
<th>Service-learning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Biology General</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>49%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business Administration</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psychology</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Percent responding “Often” for each activity, except service-learning, which is the percent responding at least “Sometimes.” Results are unweighted. The first four majors (listed at top) are examined in the following sections.

NSSE Annual Results 2010. Major Differences: Examining Student Engagement by Field of Study.

High Impact Practices (structural activities)

- Who might be interested in these results?
  - Departments – compare by major field – do these reflect disciplinary approaches?
  - Orientation staff & Advisors – how might we encourage students to consider HIPs?
  - Offices specifically associated with practices (Study Abroad Office, Community Service, Res Life)
  - Underrepresented student programs

Faculty Perception of HIPs

- Percent of faculty at Bacc LACs who indicated the following HIPs were important for their students to do:
  - Learning communities 41%
  - Service-learning 61%
  - Undergraduate research 60%

Results from FSSE 2010, www.fsse.iub.edu

How important are HIPs to your faculty?
Challenges

• Beneficial for all students, yet not all take part – differences by major, racial-ethnic groups, transfer status, first-generation
  – How to ensure more widespread participation?
• Maximizing the “compensatory effects” (for underserved students)
  – How to ensure underserved student participation?
• Cost
• Getting experience on students radar
• Institutional impediments
• What else??

What is the HIP story on your campus?

• To what extent are HIPs getting attention on campus?
• What do your HIP data look like?
• Who might be interested in your campus HIP results?
• What other analyses might you do on HIPs?

HIP Data Use and Campus Action

• Inventory availability of HIPs on campus
• Examined FY Expectations – “Plan to Do”
• Examined HIPs for underserved students
• Draw attention to effective practice
• Embed in Gen Ed, Require HIPs
• Assess impact of HIPs

Inventory Interest in HIPs

• Tulane’s NSSE FY “expect to do” results showed high levels of interest in 3 HIPs: Internships (71%), Undergraduate Research (44%), Study Abroad (62%)
• Results suggested need to expand opportunity based on student interest
• Center for Engaged Learning & Teaching created to foster HIPs (SACs QEP)

Inventory and Promote HIPs

University of Wisconsin Madison

At UWM, HIPs that have generated demonstrable student outcomes:

• In the first year:
  – FIGS (First-Year Interest Groups)
  – RLCs (Residential Learning Communities)
  – URS (Undergraduate Research Scholars)
• Available Throughout College:
  – Study Abroad
  – Service Learning/Community-based Research
  – Undergrad Research
  – Student Leadership (in class, such as Peer Mentoring, and out of class, through student organizations)
• Some aspects of Gen Ed requirements (Comm A & B, QR-A & B; options for Ethnic Studies Requirement; Honors courses)
• In the final year(s):
  – Capstones
  – Internships
  – Senior Thesis

Promote HIPs

University of Wisconsin Madison

• Intentional promotion of HIPs in Summer Orientation, Advising and Registration (SOAR)
• Ensured that Advisors asked students about their interest and intentions about HIPs
• Saw increase in number of students making inquiries into study abroad, undergraduate research
Structured, Early Exposure to HIPs

Eastern Oregon:
Ensure FYs (60% first-gen) exposed to HIPs early.
- 2 quarter, linked FY seminars;
- Undergrad Research in HUM 101

Targeting Underserved Students in Mission Relevant HIPs

HOBART AND WILLIAM SMITH COLLEGES

- Focused effort to expand two HIPs – service learning and study abroad – salient to HWS mission.
- Convinced these experiences made a difference to student persistence and engagement, HWS administrators determined who was UNDERREPRESENTED in these experiences (males & low-income students) and involved faculty & student affairs staff in devising approaches to make experiences more possible.

RISE to the IUPUI Challenge

- Research
- International Study Abroad
- Service Learning
- Experiential Learning

The challenge: Every student earning a bachelor’s degree will complete at least two of the four types of educational experiences which qualify for appearing on the student’s transcript.

Impact of HIPs: CSU Northridge

Conclusion: Multiple HIPs distributed through Gen Ed and majors would, “require only small curricular changes.” Such “modest change” can yield a significant increase in student success and persistence.

Inventory: High-Impact Practices

To what extent does your institution provide these experiences? [√ = have on campus; √ = required; estimate the % of various student populations in these activities]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Learning Community</th>
<th>First Year Seminars</th>
<th>Research w/ Faculty</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>On Our Campus</td>
<td>Required for all</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Students involved</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% First Generation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Transfer Students</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% African American</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Latino Students</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Asian American</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Other</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Adult Students</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>