High-Impact Practices: What’s all the Hype?

Jillian Kinzie
NSSE User Workshop Bucknell University April 9-10, 2015
IU Center for Postsecondary Research
Some Educational Activities are Unusually Effective

Growing evidence that “high-impact practices” provide substantial educational benefits to students

High Impact Activities

- First-Year Seminars and Experiences
- Common Intellectual Experiences
- Learning Communities
- Writing-Intensive Courses
- Collaborative Assignments and Projects
- Undergraduate Research
- Diversity/Global Learning
- Service Learning, Community-Based Learning
- Internships
- Capstone Courses/Projects
Why the Interest in HIPs?

• Increase practices associated with learning & student success
• Respected pedagogies
• Beneficial to all students
• Valued by employers
• Important to faculty
• Enjoyable for students!
Employers assess the potential value of high-impact educational practices

% saying each would help a lot/fair amount to prepare college students for success

84% Students complete a significant project before graduation that demonstrates their depth of knowledge in their major AND their acquisition of analytical, problem-solving, and communication skills (62% help a lot)

81% Students complete an internship or community-based field project to connect classroom learning with real-world experiences (66%)

81% Students develop research skills appropriate to their field and develop evidence-based analyses (57%)

73% Students work through ethical issues and debates to form their own judgments (48%)
“Just 6% of graduates had the types of experiences in college that Gallup finds strongly relate to great jobs and great lives afterward.”
Lessons: High Impact Practices

• All associated with desirable learning and personal development outcomes.
HIPs Benefits & Outcomes

HIPs positively associated with:

- Persistence & GPA
- “Deep approaches to learning”
- Higher rates of student-faculty interaction
- Increases in critical thinking, writing skills,
- Greater appreciation for diversity
- Fostering essential learning outcomes (AAC&U)
- Higher student engagement overall
- **Impact is larger for underserved students**

Bronwell, J & Swaner, L (2010); NSSE, (2007); Kuh (2008)
HIPs Relationships with Outcomes

• Deep approaches to learning help students make richer more lasting connections to material through an emphasis on integration, synthesis, and reflection.

Deep learning constructs:
– Higher-Order Learning
– Integrative Learning
– Reflective Learning

• Students’ perceptions of gains, support, and satisfaction are important measures of the student experience

Perceived gains in
– Practical competence
– Personal/social development
– General education competencies

• Supportive Campus Environment

• Overall satisfaction
What Makes HIP Effective?

“HIP Hallmarks” 6 elements that—when employed—make the practices high impact:

- They are effortful
- They help students build substantive relationships
- They help students engage across differences
- They provide students with rich feedback
- They help students apply and test what they are learning in new situations
- They provide opportunities for students to reflect on the people they are becoming

(Kuh, 2008; excerpts from O’Neill, Peer Review, 2010)
HIPs Put Student Learning at the Center

- High Engagement (Peers, Mentors, Unscripted Questions)
- High Effort (by Students)
- High Reward (for Learning)
HIPs are associated with desirable learning and personal development outcomes.

But, not all students take part in HIPs...

Across ALL institutions ...

• 47% Capstones
• 26% Research with Faculty

Differences by Race-Ethnicity & First-Gen Status

Sources: NSSE Annual Results 2014; and “Assessment of High-Impact Practices: Using Findings to Drive Change in the Compass Project,” by Ashley Finley, Spring 2011, Peer Review.
## High Impact Practices by Race/Ethnicity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>First-Year</th>
<th>Senior</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Learning Community</td>
<td>Service-Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>American Indian or Alaska Native</strong></td>
<td>18</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Asian</strong></td>
<td>14</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Black or African American</strong></td>
<td>18</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Hispanic or Latino</strong></td>
<td>15</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Native Hawaiian/Other Pacific Islander</strong></td>
<td>11</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>White</strong></td>
<td>15</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Other</strong></td>
<td>16</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Foreign or nonresident alien</strong></td>
<td>14</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Two or more races/ethnicities</strong></td>
<td>18</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Participation in HIPs Varies by Major

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major</th>
<th>First-Year Students</th>
<th>Seniors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Learning Community</td>
<td>Service-Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arts &amp; humanities</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biological sciences, agriculture, natural resources</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical sciences, math, computer science</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social sciences</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communications, media, public relations</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engineering</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health professions</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social service professions</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undecided/undeclared</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Overall</strong></td>
<td><strong>15</strong></td>
<td><strong>52</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What do First Year Students Expect?
(NSSE 2014 results)

• 76% expect to do an Internship
• 43% expect to study abroad
• 56% plan to do a capstone
• 35% expect to do research with faculty

What informs student expectations? And do these differ by race, gender??
NSSE HIP Results and Campus Reports

NSSE 2014 High-Impact Practices
Participation Comparisons
NSSEville State University

Overall HIP Participation
The Aggs below display the percentage of students who participated in High-Impact Practices. Both figures include participation in a learning community, service-learning, and research with faculty. The former figure also includes participation in an internship or field experience, study abroad, and culminating senior experience. The first segment in each bar shows the percentage of students who participated in at least two HIPs, and the full bar (both colors) represents the percentage who participated in at least one.

Statistical Comparisons
The table below compares the percentage of your students who participated in a High-Impact Practice, including the percentage who participated overall (at least one, two or more), with those at institutions in your comparison groups.

First-year
- Learning Community
- Service-learning
- Research with Faculty
- Participated in at least one
- Participated in two or more

Senior
- Learning Community
- Service-learning
- Research with Faculty
- Internship or Field Exp.
- Study Abroad
- Participated in at least one
- Participated in two or more

Note: Differences indicated by asterisks represent two or more students, and by underline serve for comparison groups.
HIP Prescription:

All Students
Do 2...
one early,
one later

Patient Name: Student

Prescription:

2 high-impact practices!

MD: [Signature]
Prescription for High-Impact Practices

NSSE Results - ALL Campuses

- First-year
  - Participated in two or more HIPs: 12%
  - Participated in one HIP: 46%

- Senior
  - Participated in two or more HIPs: 64%
  - Participated in one HIP: 23%

Note: Results weighted by institution-reported sex and enrollment status, and by institution size.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>NSSEville State</th>
<th>Public Master's L</th>
<th>Large Public</th>
<th>NSSE 2013 &amp; 2014</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Effect size</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Effect size</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>First-year</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11c. Learning Community</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
<td>15 **</td>
<td>-0.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Service-Learning</td>
<td>53</td>
<td></td>
<td>52</td>
<td>0.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11e. Research with Faculty</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Participated in at least one</strong></td>
<td>58</td>
<td></td>
<td>58</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Participated in two or more</strong></td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td>11</td>
<td>-0.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Senior</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11c. Learning Community</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>-0.02</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>-0.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Service-Learning</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>63 **</td>
<td>0.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11e. Research with Faculty</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>0.36</td>
<td>21 ***</td>
<td>0.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11a. Internship or Field Exp.</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>47 ***</td>
<td>0.31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11d. Study Abroad</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>0.22</td>
<td>9 ***</td>
<td>0.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11f. Culminating Senior Exp.</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>0.56</td>
<td>43 ***</td>
<td>0.53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Participated in at least one</strong></td>
<td>95</td>
<td>0.33</td>
<td>85 ***</td>
<td>0.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Participated in two or more</strong></td>
<td>80</td>
<td>0.48</td>
<td>61 ***</td>
<td>0.43</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
NSSE 2014 High-Impact Practices
Participation by Student Characteristics
NSSEville State University

## Participation in High-Impact Practices by Student Characteristics

The table below displays the percentage of your students who participated in each HIP by selected student characteristics. Examining participation rates for different groups offers insight into how engagement varies within your student population.

### First-year Participation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristic</th>
<th>Learning Community</th>
<th>Service-Learning</th>
<th>Research with Faculty</th>
<th>Internship or Field Experience</th>
<th>Study Abroad</th>
<th>Culminating Senior Experience</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sex</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Race/ethnicity or international</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American Indian or Alaska Native</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black or African American</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic or Latino</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Native Hawaiian/Other Pac. Islander</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreign or nonresident alien</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two or more races/ethnicities</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traditional (FY &lt; 21, Seniors &lt; 25):</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nontraditional (FY 21+, Seniors 25+)</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>44</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>First-generation</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not first-generation</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First-generation</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Enrollment status</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not full-time</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full-time</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residence</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Living off campus</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Living on campus</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
#3 High-Impact Practices

- What was this worksheet designed for/to do?
- When is the best time to use this worksheet?
  - As you start to look at NSSE Results
  - When seeking guidance on how to look within your NSSE Results
- Who is the best group to share this with?
  - Groups that have direct connections to HIPs, first year initiatives and senior capstone
#3 High-Impact Practices: Debrief

In order to use this worksheet you will need your…

High-Impact Practices Report

…Specifically, page 8
#3 High-Impact Practices: Debrief

Use this column to focus on a specific subpopulation, i.e. you want to see how FYs who participated in a Bridge Program did in comparison to the rest of their FY peers.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>First-Year Students</td>
<td>Learning Community</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Service-Learning</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Research with Faculty</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Participated in at least one of the above</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
#3 High-Impact Practices: Debrief

Use this column to link FSSE data for a conversation on faculty expectations of student behaviors alongside student scores.
HIPS: What Action Has Your Campuses Taken to...

- Prescribe 2 HIPS by graduation
- Promote equity
- Ensure quality
- Assess effectiveness & impact
Equity: High-Impact Practice Participation

• To think about...
  – Do all your students have access to HIPs?
  – What proportion of students would you like to participate in HIPs?
  – What student populations are less likely to participate in HIPs?
Faculty Perception of HIPs

- How important is it to faculty that undergraduates do HIPs ("very important + important"):
  - Culminating Exp/Capstone 86%
  - Internships 82%
  - Community Service 58%
  - Research with faculty 57%
  - Learning comm.(FY) 46%
  - Study Abroad 41%

» FSSE 2014 Upper Division Faculty results
The Relationship between Faculty Values & Senior Participation in HIPs

**FSSE Finding:**

“If faculty view activity as important, students are more likely to do it.”
Campus Action on High Impact Practices
Types of Campus Action on HIPs

• Inventory interest in & availability of HIPs
• Promote opportunities to students early
• Target underserved students
• Scaffold across the undergraduate program
• Engage departments
• Embed or require HIPs
• Assess impact of HIPs
Inventory Interest in HIPs

• Tulane’s NSSE FY “expect to do” results showed high levels of interest in 3 HIPs: Internships (71%), Undergraduate Research (44%), Study Abroad (62%)

• Results suggested need to expand opportunity based on student interest

• Center for Engaged Learning & Teaching created to foster HIPs
At UWM, HIPs that have generated demonstrable student outcomes:

- **In the first year:**
  - FIGS (First-Year Interest Groups)
  - RLCs (Residential Learning Communities)
  - URS (Undergraduate Research Scholars)

- **Available Throughout College:**
  - Study Abroad
  - Service Learning/Community-based Research
  - Undergrad Research
  - Student Leadership (in class, such as Peer Mentoring, and out of class, through student organizations)

- **Some aspects of Gen Ed requirements** (Comm A & B, QR-A & B; options for Ethnic Studies Requirement); Honors courses

- **In the final year(s):**
  - Capstones
  - Internships
  - Senior Thesis
Promote HIPs
University of Wisconsin Madison

• Intentional promotion of HIPs in Summer Orientation, Advising and Registration (SOAR)
• Ensured that Advisors asked students about their interest and intentions about HIPs
• Saw increase in number of students making inquiries into study abroad, undergraduate research
Structured, Early Exposure to HIPs

Eastern Oregon:
Ensure FYs (60% first-gen) exposed to HIPs early.

– 2 quarter, linked FY seminars;
– Undergrad Research in HUM 101
Purdue University - College of Science
Learning Beyond the Classroom Certificate Program

- Voluntary program to encourage COS students to engage in hands-on experience & opportunities to apply classroom knowledge
- Attending, organizing, leading in 3 categories:
  - *career and professional development* (research, internships, job shadowing)
  - *service, citizenship and leadership*; (service learning; serving as a College of Science Ambassador, acting as teaching assist. /tutor).
  - *experience with domestic and international diversity* (study abroad, mentoring programs, and diversity organizations)
- Progress tracked by point system; varies with intensity of activity; activities evaluated based on student reports.
Elon University

• **Elon Experiences Transcript (EET)** documents participation in 5 program areas:
  • Leadership Development
  • Service Learning
  • Internships/Co-ops
  • Study Abroad/Intercultural Experiences
  • Student Undergraduate Research

• Each involves a high degree of experiential learning, which adds to the total college experience and prepares students as lifelong learners and citizens
Exercise: Increasing HIP Access

How might you address 1 of the following recommendations for increasing access to HIPs?

• **Be intentional** about structuring HIPs & assess outcomes
• Introduce HIPs **early and often** -- get experience on students radar and debunk myths
• **Embed** HIPs into Curriculum, Requirements, Advising,
• Expose students to “**mini-HIPs**” (short term study abroad, research in a course)
• **Infuse** the hallmarks of HIPs & pedagogical practices in more courses and programs
• Encourage a robust **partnership** between academic & student affairs
Generating Interest

• Orientation staff and academic advisors—*how might they encourage students to consider HIPs?*

• HIP offices (study abroad office, community service, res life, etc.)—*how can they get extra support?*

• Underrepresented student programs—*how can HIPs reach more students?*

• Departments—*how can HIPs be integrated into disciplines?*

• Faculty—*how can faculty get involved?*
Discussion and Comments

Jillian Kinzie, PhD.
NSSE Institute
Indiana University Center for Postsecondary Research
1900 East 10th Street
Eigenmann Hall, Suite 419
Bloomington, IN 47406
Ph: 812-856-5824
Fax: 812-856-5150
jikinzie@indiana.edu

www.nsse.iub.edu